

UNITED
NATIONS

EP



**United Nations
Environment
Programme**



Distr.
LIMITED

UNEP(DEC)/CAR WG.26/4
19 April 2004

ENGLISH
Original: ENGLISH

Workshop on the draft Guidelines for the
listing of Protected Areas under the SPAW
Protocol

Gosier, Guadeloupe, 19-23 April 2004

DRAFT

**GRID FOR THE OBJECTIVE EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS
FOR INCLUSION IN THE SPAW PROTECTED AREAS LIST**

DRAFT**GRID FOR THE OBJECTIVE EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS
FOR INCLUSION IN THE SPAW PROTECTED AREAS LIST****I. OBJECTIVES**

1. The purpose of the grid is to assess as objectively as possible, and with the highest degree of homogeneity, the degree of conformity of the sites proposed for inclusion in the SPAW Protected Areas List with the criteria defined according to the Protocol.
2. This Grid will be used by the SPAW/RAC and the STAC for SPAW to perform the due-diligence regarding the nominations for inclusion of sites in the SPAW Protected Areas List.

II. TYPE OF CRITERIA AS SET IN THE GUIDELINES

3. Regarding the Guidelines, two kinds of selection criteria can be identified:
 - Characteristics/features that the site must necessarily comply to be eligible for inclusion in the SPAW List. These are given in the General Principles agreed by the Parties in the “Guidelines and Criteria for the Evaluation of Protected Areas to be listed under SPAW” (UNEP(DEC)/CAR WG.26/2). For these features, a yes/no (presence/absence) evaluation is given.
 - Other Criteria are evaluated as a value-added, following section B (II) of the “Guidelines and Criteria for the Evaluation of Protected Areas to be listed under SPAW”. Their cumulative rating is an indication of the global value of the site as a potential listed Area. These criteria are qualified in a semi-quantitative way according to predetermined classes of 0-1-2-3 (null, low, medium and high degree respectively).

III. CONTENTS OF THE GRID

4. The criteria grid in this document and the document “Annotated Format for the Presentation Reports for the Areas proposed for Inclusion in the SPAW List”, (UNEP(DEC)/CAR WG.26/3) keep a crossed coherence.
5. Additionally to the criteria set in the Protocol and the “Guidelines and Criteria for the Evaluation of Protected Areas to be listed under SPAW”, the following have also been considered:
 - The Protection Measures and the Planning and Management Measures included in the Protocol (Art.5 and Art.6 respectively). Some of these measures for Protected Areas are already included in the Guidelines and Criteria, but others are not. The latter are marked with (*) so they can be easily identified and if necessary moved into another section of the grid (e.g. into the “non-mandatory features”) or else completely removed from the grid.

- Features either logically related to the main mandatory criteria, or commonly used in other Conventions. These features are not presented as mandatory but as adding value to the nomination of the area. Please note that these are all marked with (**) so they can be easily identified and if necessary, removed from the proposed grid.

6. All these criteria and features have been set into three sections:

- **Section I. Caribbean Importance:**

Includes those features in paragraph B (1) of the “Guidelines and Criteria for the Evaluation of Protected Areas to be listed under SPAW” of which at least one of them must be fully complied by the candidate area to be accepted in the SPAW Protected Areas List.

- **Section II. Mandatory Criteria:**

Includes the criteria, which are obligatory for the inclusion of an area in the SPAW Protected Areas List. These are all those obligatory for a Protected Area as set in the “Guidelines and Criteria for the evaluation of Protected Areas to be listed under SPAW” (paragraph A, C et D), plus those obligatory in Articles 5 and 6 of the Protocol.

- **Section III. Additional features:**

Includes features that, not being mandatory, provide a value-added to the candidate area: those in Section B (4) of the “Guidelines and Criteria for the Evaluation of Protected Areas to be listed under SPAW”, and many other details related to the mandatory criteria in section II.

When possible, the items in a section have been arranged in thematic clusters (particularly the features which can be quantified with 0-3) so that these values can be added giving an indication of the value of candidate area in the different items (nature, legal, management...).

SECTION I: CARIBBEAN IMPORTANCE OF THE AREA

1. CONTAINS ECOSYSTEMS SPECIFIC TO THE WIDER CARIBBEAN REGION OR THE HABITATS OF ENDANGERED SPECIES
(Art. B.I. of the Guidelines)

1.1 Presence of ecosystems/habitats specific to the Wider Caribbean Region

Y	N
---	---

(Habitat is any area in the range of a species of fauna or flora which contains suitable living conditions)

1.2 Presence of habitats that are critical to endangered, threatened or endemic species

Y	N
---	---

(A critical habitat is an area essential to the conservation of the species concerned. This species should be related to those included in Annexes 1 and 2 of the Protocol)

2. IMPORTANCE FOR THE CONSERVATION OF COMPONENTS OF BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY IN THE WIDER CARIBBEAN REGION
(Art. B.I. of the Guidelines)

2.1 Degree of Uniqueness (B.II.a of the Guidelines)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(The area contains unique or rare ecosystems, or rare or endemic species)

2.2 Natural representativeness (B.II.b of the Guidelines) **and adequate size** (*)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(Art. 4(a) of the Protocol)
(The area has highly representative ecological processes, or community or habitat types or other natural characteristics. Representativeness is the degree to which an area represents a habitat type, ecological process, biological community, physiographic feature or other natural characteristic. Adequate size is a significant feature)

2.3 Diversity (B.II.c of the Guidelines)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(The area has a specially high diversity of species, communities, habitats or ecosystems)

2.4 Naturalness (B.II.d of the Guidelines)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(The area has a high degree of naturalness as a result of the lack or low level of human induced disturbance and degradation)

3. THE AREA IS OF SPECIAL INTEREST AT THE SCIENTIFIC, AESTHETIC, CULTURAL OR EDUCATIONAL LEVELS (Art. B.I. of the Guidelines)

3.1 Special scientific interest:

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

The area presents a particular value for research in the field of natural sciences (B.III. of the Guidelines)

3.2 Aesthetic interest:

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

The area contains outstanding natural features, landscapes or seascapes (B.III. of the Guidelines)

3.3 Educational interest:

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

The area presents particular value for activities of environmental education or awareness (B.III. of the Guidelines)

3.4 Cultural Representativeness (B.II.f of the Guidelines):

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(The area has a high representative value with respect to the cultural heritage, sound due to the existence of environmentally sound traditional activities integrated with nature which support the well-being of local populations)

SECTION II: LEGAL AND MANAGEMENT CRITERIA WHICH ARE MANDATORY FOR THE INCLUSION OF AN AREA IN THE SPAW LIST

Obligatory for a listed PA (as set in the General Principles and C and D of the Guidelines)

4. LEGAL DECLARATION

4.1. Legal protection status (General Principles "III" And C.II. of the Guidelines)

Y	N
---	---

(e.g the area enjoys protection at the highest national level. If the area includes marine environments, these are adequately protected by the same legal instrument or by other appropriate national legal framework)

4.2. Does the legal declaration of this area consider the conservation of natural values as the primary objective of the protected Area?

Y	N
---	---

(General Principles "I" and D.I. of the Guidelines)

4.3. Does the legal declaration of this area clearly define the main management objectives of the area? (D.I. of the Guidelines)

Y	N
---	---

(Such as main objectives, uses, basic regulations, management responsibilities)

4.4. Has the management plan been officialized?

Y	N
---	---

4.5. Is the management plan binding for other national/local administrations with competencies in the area?

Y	N
---	---

4.6. Is the area transboundary or within areas where the limits of national sovereignty or jurisdiction have not yet been defined?

Y	N
---	---

(Article 9 of the Protocol)

4.6.1 If yes, have the involved Parties consulted each other with a view to ensuring the consistency of the proposed protection and management measures, as well a means for their implementation?

Y	N
---	---

(Article 9 of the Protocol and General Principles "V" of the Guidelines)

5. PROTECTION MEASURES (General Principles "III" of the Guidelines)

<p>5.1 Are the protection measures adequate to the achievement OF the objectives of the area? (D.II.of the Guidelines) <i>(e.g. marked boundaries, regulations on the use of natural resources, existing field enforcement measures and adequate penalties, basic financial means for an operational protection system)</i></p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>Y</td><td>N</td></tr></table>	Y	N
Y	N		
<p>5.2 Does the area benefit from stronger regulations enforcing other Protocols in the Cartagena Convention? (D.V. of the Guidelines) <i>(e.g. on dumping, on passage of ships, on exploration or modification of the soil, seabed subsoil...)</i></p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>Y</td><td>N</td></tr></table>	Y	N
Y	N		

6. MANAGEMENT METHODS (General principles "III" of the Guidelines)

<p>6.1 Existence of a management body (D.VI. of the Guidelines)</p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>Y</td><td>N</td></tr></table>	Y	N
Y	N		
<p>6.2 Are competencies and responsibilities clearly defined in the texts governing the area? (D.IV. of the Guidelines)</p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>Y</td><td>N</td></tr></table>	Y	N
Y	N		
<p>6.3 Existence of a management plan (Art. 6(b) of the Protocol and D.VII. of the Guidelines)</p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>Y</td><td>N</td></tr></table>	Y	N
Y	N		
<p>6.3.1. In case of "no" in 6.3 (D.VII. of the Guidelines)</p>			
<p>6.3.1.1. Are the management rules implemented immediately?</p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>Y</td><td>N</td></tr></table>	Y	N
Y	N		
<p>6.3.1.2. Will the management rules be defined as from the time of inclusion</p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>Y</td><td>N</td></tr></table>	Y	N
Y	N		
<p>6.3.1.3. Will the area have a detailed management plan in the next 3 years?</p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>Y</td><td>N</td></tr></table>	Y	N
Y	N		

7. AVAILABILITY OF RESOURCES: HUMAN, MATERIAL, AND INFORMATION

(*)7.1 Is there a permanent staff commissioned for the area? (Art. 6.2(i) of the Protocol)

(e.g. a field administrator, enough protection personnel or other permanent staff with presence in the field)

Y	N
---	---

(*) 7.2 Is basic financing ensured?

(Art. 6.2(f) of the Protocol) *(e.g. core funding for basic staff, protection and information measures)*

Y	N
---	---

(*) 7.3 Is there basic infrastructure and equipment in the field? (Art. 6.2.(i) of the Protocol)

(e.g. field office, guard post, signs, radio or vehicles)

Y	N
---	---

7.5 Is there a monitoring programme (D.VIII. in the Guidelines) or a programme to collect data in the area? (D.III. of the Guidelines)

(e.g. on species status and populations, the condition of the ecosystem, land-use changes, extraction of natural resources: sand, water, game, fish, visitation, adherence to the provisions of the management plan...)

Y	N
---	---

SECTION III: FEATURES PROVIDING A VALUE-ADDED TO THE CANDIDATE AREA*(Section B.IV. of the Guidelines, and some obligatory for a PA (Arts. 5 et 6 of the Protocol))***8. LEGAL ASPECTS AND REGULATIONS****8.1. Are there special regulations,**

8.1.1. Regulation of any activity likely to harm or disturb
The species, or that might endanger the conservation status
of the ecosystems or species or might impair the natural,
cultural or aesthetic characteristics of the area?
(D.V.c of the Guidelines)

Y	N
---	---

8.1.2. Regulations for the surrounding zones to the area?
(Section D.V.d of the Guidelines)

Y	N
---	---

(* 8.1.3. Stronger regulations on passage of ships
and any stopping or anchoring?
(Art.5(c) of the Protocol)

Y	N
---	---

(* 8.1.4. Regulation of any activity involving exploration
or modification of the soil or the exploitation of the subsoil of the
land part, the seabed or its subsoil
(Art. 5(g) of the Protocol)

Y	N
---	---

(* 8.1.5. Regulations of archeological activity?
(Art 5(i) of the Protocol)

Y	N
---	---

(* 8.1.6. Regulation of fishing, hunting, taking of animals
and harvesting of plants or their destruction, as well as trade
animals, parts of animals, plants, parts of plants, which originate in
the area?
(Art. 5(d) of the Protocol)

Y	N
---	---

9. THREATS AND SURROUNDING CONTEXT

9.1 Assess the level of external threats to the ecological, biological, aesthetic and cultural values of the area (B.IV.a of the guidelines)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

9.2 In particular

9.2.1 (**) Unregulated extraction of natural resources
(e.g. sand mining, water, timber, living resources)

Y	N
---	---

9.2.2 (**) Serious threats on habitats
(e.g. disturbance, dissecation, pollution...)

Y	N
---	---

9.2.3 (**) Serious threats on species
(e.g. introduced alien species, poaching...)

Y	N
---	---

9.2.4 (**) Increase of human presence
(e.g. tourism, boats, building, immigration...)

Y	N
---	---

9.2.5 (**) Significant impacts on landscapes and on cultural values

Y	N
---	---

9.2.6 (**) Pollution problems from external sources
(e.g. solid waste from visitors or from other sources,
or chemical/physical pollutants on water)

Y	N
---	---

9.3. Is there an integrated coastal management plan in the area limiting or surrounding the candidate PA?

(B.IV.e of the Guidelines)

Y	N
---	---

9.4. Does the management plan provide regulations for the surrounding zones?

Y	N
---	---

10. PROTECTION MEASURES

10.1. In general, assess the degree of enforcement of the protection measures

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

10.2. In particular:

(**) 10.2.1. Are the physical limits of the area adequately marked/advertised on land?

Y	N
---	---

(**) 10.2.2. If applicable, are the physical limits of the area adequately marked/advertised on the sea?

Y	N
---	---

(**) 10.2.3. Are there adequate penalties and powers for effective enforcement of regulations?

Y	N
---	---

(**) 10.2.4. Is the field staff empowered to impose sanctions?

Y	N
---	---

(**) 10.2.5 If applicable, is there a coastguard service contributing to the marine protection?

Y	N
---	---

11. MANAGEMENT

11.1. Assess the present adequacy of the planning and management measures (D.II of the Guidelines)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(Protection, planning and management measures applicable to each area must be adequate for the achievement of the conservation and management objectives set for the site in the short and long term, and take in particular into account the threats upon it)

() 11.2. Assess the adequacy of the size of the area to achieve its conservation objectives**

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

() 11.3. Assess to what extent is land ownership well determined**

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(undetermined and tenure regimes and registrations are a common source of conflicts in most protected areas world-wide)

11.4. If there is a management plan:

() 11.4.1 Assess the degree of detail of the management plan**

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(e.g. zoning, regulations for each zone, competencies and responsibilities, governing bodies, management programmes as protection, natural resource management, tourism, public use, education, research, monitoring, maintenance, services and concessions...)

() 11.4.2 Assess the degree of implementation of the management plan**

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

() 11.4.3 Is the management plan subject to periodic revision and evaluation**

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

11.5. Assess the quality of the involvement of the public, and particularly of local communities, in the planning and management of the area (B.IV.b of the Guidelines)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(e.g. adequate planning involves local stakeholders and accommodates within appropriate management regimes a spectrum of possible multiple uses and regulated human activities, within the primary objective of conservation of marine and coastal environments)

11.6. Is there a body representing the public, professional and non-governmental sector and the scientific community?

Y	N
---	---

(B4 of the Annex 1)

() 11.7. Is there a scientific committee linked to the management body?**

Y	N
---	---

12. HUMAN RESOURCES

12.1. Assess the adequacy of the human resources available to the management body (Art.6.2(i) of the Protocol)
(e.g. enough number of employees and adequate training level to ensure protection of the area)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(**) 12.1.1. Is there a permanent field administrator of the area?

Y	N
---	---

(**) 12.1.2. Are there other permanent staff on the field
(e.g. technicians, guides...)

Y	N
---	---

(*) 12.2. Are there available means, programmes or activities for the training of managers and qualified personnel?
(Art. 6.2(i) of the Protocol)

Y	N
---	---

(**) 12.3. Are other national/international organizations collaborating with human resources? *(e.g. researchers, experts, volunteers)*

Y	N
---	---

13. FINANCING AND MATERIAL RESOURCES

() 13.1. Assess the degree of adequacy of the present financing means** (*Sufficient resources for the development and implementation of the management plan, including e.g. interpretation, education, training, research, surveillance and enforcement of regulations*)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

() 13.2. Assess perspectives for long-term funding from national or other sources**

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(*) 13.3. Assess the adequacy of basic infrastructure and equipment
(Art. 6.2(i) in the Protocol)

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(**) 13.3.1. Is there an office in the field?

Y	N
---	---

(**) 13.3.2. Are there guard posts or signs on the main accesses?

Y	N
---	---

(**) 13.3.3. Are there visitors' facilities?
(*reception center, trails, signs...*)

Y	N
---	---

(**) 13.3.4. Assess the adequacy of basic equipment, including vehicles (land and marine), telecommunications

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

(**) 13.3.5 Assess the capacity to respond to emergencies

0	1	2	3
---	---	---	---

() 13.4. Are there specific information, education and awareness materials?**

Y	N
---	---

14. INFORMATION AND KNOWLEDGE

<p>(**) 14.1. Assess the extent of knowledge of the area <i>(considering at least specific maps, habitat distribution, inventories of species, and socio-economical factors)</i></p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>0</td><td>1</td><td>2</td><td>3</td></tr></table>	0	1	2	3
0	1	2	3		
<p>14.2. If existing, assess the adequacy of the programme to collect data in the area</p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>0</td><td>1</td><td>2</td><td>3</td></tr></table>	0	1	2	3
0	1	2	3		
<p>14.3. If existing assess the adequacy of the monitoring programme <i>(e.g. on species status and populations, the condition of the ecosystem, land-use changes, extraction of natural resources – sand, water, game, fish-, visitation, adherence to the provisions of the management plan, etc...)</i></p>	<table border="1"><tr><td>0</td><td>1</td><td>2</td><td>3</td></tr></table>	0	1	2	3
0	1	2	3		